



INDONESIAN MIGRANT WORKERS' DOUBLE JOB, DOUBLE RISK: COMMODIFICATION OF LIFE CONTENT

Syfa Amelia^{1*} Elisabeth Adventa Galuh²

¹ Department of Film, TV, and Media Studies, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Pembangunan Nasional Veteran Jakarta, Indonesia

² Department of Communication Science, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

Indonesian migrant workers are currently seeing a new trend: part-time content creators on social media, documenting their lives and making videos or live streams about their lives in a new country. This is a common thing among the diaspora to document their lives in a different country. Indonesian migrant workers who commonly work as unskilled laborers see that the potential of being content creators of social media will give them better welfare and life quality. Using Pierre Bourdieu's theory of capital commodification, we conduct exploratory research to investigate problems with commodification content that is not clearly defined. The first step we take is to do observations of migrant workers content creators, and then we do online research and literature research to strengthen our research on a specific case, which is Zhiee Leely and Mboke Memey on YouTube. The results show that Indonesian migrant workers are unconsciously being commodified in a habitus that leads them to get financial benefits by producing daily content on YouTube. It means they need to do a double job, longer working hours, more risks, without government social security, because only being a migrant worker does not guarantee a better life.

Keywords:

migrant workers, commodification, welfare, social media, content creator

1. INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is a country with a large number of migrant workers and is one of the sectors that underpin the country's economy. Indonesia is a country with the second-largest number of migrant workers in Asia after the Philippines (IOM, 2010). Globalization and policies of migration in Indonesia since the reform era have facilitated the ease for working abroad. However, it does not mean that all Indonesian migrant workers are guaranteed their welfare and are ensured to live safely overseas. Many migrant workers have to rack their brains to get jobs with more decent wages to support themselves and their families at home. Following the trend of the digital era, not a few migrant workers have followed the trend of becoming content creators and creating content about their lives abroad. This offers many novelties, such as a new and foreign environment for most Indonesian viewers, so they can get a large number of views. The platform used initially was YouTube, and then it grew here with TikTok.

Globalization has long been mentioned as a contributing factor to the free movement of people. In fact, mobilization with freedom is wanted by many as a compelling reason for them to seek a better life anywhere outside their country of origin. (Deng, Wahyuni, and Yulianto 2020)

*Corresponding author.

E-mail: syfaamelia@upnvj.ac.id

Even so, globalization faces many challenges, one of which is migration that causes social inequality to cross and beyond national boundaries. Of the many global mobility regimes, migrant workers and international travelers are the two groups that are most involved in the problem of social inequality. (Koslowski, 2011).

Martyn (2017) mentioned in his research that policies in Indonesia have contributed to the high number of migrant workers from Indonesia. During the reformation era, when Indonesia was experiencing an economic crisis after President Suharto stepped down and the country suffered losses everywhere, poor people suddenly appeared in large numbers. Many human resources, especially those in the regions, did not have the luxury of getting access to education and training, making it more difficult for them to get jobs in the midst of a crisis. For this reason, the state has made a policy to encourage people to work in other countries, such as Malaysia and Singapore, to work in the domestic sphere, which does not require special skills. In addition, every dollar that migrant workers earn abroad will have an exchange rate that strengthens the rupiah when they are taken home.

In the meeting between Malaysian PM Anwar Ibrahim and Indonesian President Joko Widodo, it was stated that Anwar would continue to fight for the protection and better welfare of Indonesian workers in Malaysia. Although the graph of the number of migrant worker complaints and death rate in Malaysia has decreased in recent years (Arif, 2023), it does not mean that the focus on overseeing the issue of migrant workers must also decrease or even disappear.

1. Indonesian Migrant Workers

The number of migrant workers in the world is high, so the problem of migrant workers must be of particular concern. The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) and the United Nations conducted research showing that there are approximately 232 million international immigrants living in countries other than their country of origin, and the number has been relatively stable over the past few decades, namely 3.2% of the world's population (Migration Facts and Figures). The Asia Pacific region, which has 3 of the 4 most populous countries, including China, India, and Indonesia, is the largest source of immigrants. In 2010, there were 27.5 million international immigrants in Asia and the Asia Pacific, most of whom came from India, Indonesia, the Philippines, and Vietnam. While the destination countries are Japan, Korea, Hong Kong, Singapore, and China, which provide employment opportunities and higher income than in their home country (IOM, UN Migration). In 2013, the International Labor Organization (ILO) estimated that there were 30 million migrant workers in the region, with 42% of immigrants in Asia and 50% in Oceania (Hugo, 2014).

These workers leave their countries to earn a better life for their families as documented or undocumented immigrants. In the Asia-Pacific region, a significant majority of immigrants are illegal and undocumented immigrants. In Thailand, approximately 3.1 million immigrants are citizens of neighbouring Myanmar, Cambodia, and Laos, half of whom are illegal and undocumented. In 2020, Indonesia had 1.8 million registered immigrants in Malaysia and an estimated number of unregistered immigrants (Marin, 2013).

Nonetheless, migrant workers contribute greatly to their country's economy. In the Philippines, 12% of their GDP in 2009 came from migrant workers, while in Nepal it reached 22%. In the Asia-Pacific region, economic changes are

also supporting rapid urbanization, and the effects are creating many health issues (Mou, Fong, and Dawes, 2014).

Migrant workers often work in the most undesirable sectors with high risks related to work accidents. They are seen as commodities and short-term labor investments and are not given massive training and instructions on occupational safety and health (Corvalan, Driscoll, and Harrison 1994). In China, migrant workers have a higher chance of being injured at work, but there is no systematic collection of statistics on cases across the region (Fitzgerald et al, 2013). There have been many reports of exploitation and violence, including long working hours, unpaid work, and even physical abuse such as beatings, rape, starvation, and forced confinement (Hugo, 2014).

Michael Piore's (1979) theory of dual labour explains that the structure of the modern labor market in developed countries has been oriented to the needs of migrant workers. The dual labour market is meant by dividing it into two categories. First, the primary sector, which is dominated by non-immigrant workers with characteristics of reasonable wages and multilevel job security. Then, the secondary sector is dominated by migrant workers and suffers from poor wages and sub-optimal conditions for safe work and jobs. Currently, Piore's theory is being criticized because it is considered to oversimplify the employment sector into two types, namely primary and secondary. This theory was developed not only to be classified into two dual sectors but to focus more on segmented jobs.

In the case of Malaysia, immigrant workers receive a negative stigma and are even represented in the media (Don and Lee, 2014). KhosraviNik (2009) explained that this was due to ideological polarization between "us" and "them," with "them" being perceived as a threat to other people. This anti-immigrant view is related to state sovereignty and border control. In cases of illegal or undocumented immigrants, they have two implications: first, they receive discriminatory treatment from fellow illegal immigrants and are vulnerable to raids, arrest, imprisonment, and deportation by security and immigration officials. Second, because of their illegal status in Malaysia, they will not get the opportunity or integration into the local community.

2. YouTube as Prosumer Media

The concept of "prosumer" was first put forward by Alvin Toffler, a businessman and writer from the United States. Toffler offers wavefront analysis, an analytical concept that is able to help understand the force factors behind various changes that occur in society as a whole. Wavefront analysis divides the series of changes in society into 3 waves, the first wave, the second wave, and the third wave. The analysis looks at history as a series of rolling waves of change and asks where the leading edge of each wave of change is and carry us (Toffler, 1980).

In his work entitled *The Third Wave* (1980), Toffler introduced the idea of the prosumer, which stands for producer and consumer. The idea is a progressive blurring line that separates the roles of producer and consumer. According to Toffler, Third Wave civilization influenced all areas of people's lives. There are many things in this emerging civilization that contradict the old traditional industrial civilization. The potential for change in the Third Wave has far-reaching impacts on people's lives and its own logic is at odds with the logic of industrial

civilization. At the same time, Third Wave civilizations were technologically advanced and anti-industrial. Third Wave civilization began to “cure” the historical breaches between producers and consumers that occurred in the Second Wave civilization, giving rise to the “prosumer” economy of the future (Toffler, 1980).

Toffler is optimistic that with Third Wave civilizations, he thinks the civilization we live in today could turn into the first truly human civilization in recorded history. This optimism is rooted in the dynamics of the Third Wave which forced political and economic systems to change, to become more democratic and less bureaucratic, to provide more space for individual autonomy and at the same time be more effective.

In media studies, the concept of prosumer was also adopted by Henry Jenkins to define media convergence. Jenkins and Mark Deuze (2008) concluded that convergence has the ability to empower the prosumer generation. Advances in technology with all its connectivity have made the communication climate more participatory. Audience position becomes horizontal and actively involved in information exchange (Jenkin, 2004). George Ritzer (in Gane & Beer, 2008) states that prosumer as a term for people's production and consumption activities in the digital era will later lead to horizontal and simultaneous sharing of information.

Jenkins and Deuze's argument drew criticism from researchers because it was considered to show convergence weaknesses. However, both of them considered their arguments to be able to counterbalance the aspects of top-down and bottom-up convergence. Sometimes these two forces (producers and prosumers) reinforce each other, creating a closer, more fruitful relationship between media producers and consumers. At times the two forces come into conflict, resulting in a continual re-negotiation of power between currents of competitive pressures on the new media ecology (Jenkin & Deuze, 2008).

Apart from bringing new challenges, the era of media convergence also brings new opportunities for the technology-based media industry. The emergence of digital media platforms, including YouTube, is a sign that the visual and audio needs of media users can still be accommodated. YouTube users in Indonesia have continued to increase in recent years, playing a major role in increasing the popularity of this video-based platform. Based on the We Are Social report, YouTube has penetrated 127 million users in Indonesia, and YouTube's market share in Indonesia has reached 21.42% as of April 2022, the second highest after Facebook. YouTube places its users in three positions, namely as content producers (*content creators*, consumers, or both prosumers). The ease of access offered by YouTube allows everyone to create their own content, even if they are not professionals.

3. Giddens' Structuration, Theory of Capital, and Commodification

The concept of structuration emerged because of Anthony Giddens' criticism of the theory of functionalism and evolutionary theory. The structuring offered by Giddens emphasizes the importance of social practice, both in action and in structure. Social practices are understood as the correspondence between speech and action, or between significance and action (Abercrombie, Hill, Turner 2006). The most important thing in structuration theory lies in how a structure is produced and reproduced by social agents (humans) through various actions. There is a dialectical relationship between structure and action because each

action contributes to the process of reproduction of structure, as well as an act of construction as an intentional effort to initiate the change of the structure itself, along with the process of reproduction (Giddens, 2010). Thus, in general, it can be said that Giddens focuses attention on the dialectical process in which social practices, structures, and consciousness are created (Ritzer, 2004).

Giddens agents will monitor their own thinking and activities as well as their own social and physical context on a continual basis (in Ritzer, 2004). Meanwhile, actors will rationalize, reflect, and motivate themselves to feel safe and face life more efficiently. The actor will stop being an agent if he loses power, namely the ability to create conflict even though the structure still provides coercion or constraints. Then agency according to Giddens is the structural conditions in which human actions are realized (in Jones, 2010). In other words, whatever happens, will not affect the structure if the individual does not interfere with it.

Giddens' structuration theory is further supported by advanced concepts formulated by Pierre Bourdieu regarding habitus, the theory of capital, and symbolic violence. The main key in Bourdieu's theoretical synthesis lies in the concept of habitus. According to him, habitus is a combination of objective structure and personal history that lasts a long time and changes, positioned as a generative basis for structured practices (Lubis, 2014). Just like Giddens who focuses on awareness and reflectivity to find out how agents participate or how agents "act" in the context of social life (Ritzer & Goodman, 2004).

Bourdieu's habitus concept also focuses on the reflective results of various socio-cultural values, from the internalization of social structures, and is a historical product that is formed after humans are born and interact with society in a certain time and space. Habitus is also the result of learning through parenting and interaction/socialization in society, the learning process penetrates very subtly, unconsciously, and appears as a natural thing (Takwin, 2003). In Bourdieu's view, individuals are not completely free agents, nor are they passive products of social structures that influence each other in an arena (Saifudin, 2014). In addition to habitus, the concept of the arena has an important role in shaping the practices or actions of agents. The arena in Bourdieu's concept is a space where social actors/agents compete with each other for various resources, in the form of material or symbolic power. Competition is what is used as a source of symbolic power (Lubis, 2014).

To obtain a source of power, social agents/actors require capital or capital in the habitus. According to Bourdieu, economic understanding has narrowed the meaning of capital, thus forming a wrong understanding. So far, capital has always led to an economy that is only measured by money. Bourdieu (in Harker et al, 2009) divides the capital into 4 types, namely economic capital, social capital, cultural capital, and symbolic capital. Economic capital is one of the most influential forms of material capital, such as money, property, investment, and so on. Social capital is in the form of social relations within a certain community or often called connections. The owners of the largest social capital are those with the widest network of social relations among others. Furthermore, cultural capital is one of the capitals that have the potential to be converted into money and prestige in terms of education. And lastly, symbolic capital is the only formless capital, not

easily accepted by logic and knowledge, but can be converted into three other forms of capital.

In the view of political economy, capital has a very central role. Political economy prioritizes the goal of understanding social change and historical transformation by focusing attention on how capitalist control, support for capitalist control, and commercial support of the media tend to serve elite interests which are not only anathema to society but also to democratic values (McChesney, 1998). The part of political economy used by researchers in this article is commodification. Vincent Mosco (2009) defines commodification as a process of transforming use values into exchange values. Mosco is of the view that commodities are no longer only determined based on market needs, but more emphasis is placed on what aspects can be sold on the market.

According to Polanyi (in Shields & Grant, 2010), one of the most prominent characteristics of the liberal market is the commodification of labor. Currently, society is in an era where jobs are bought and sold freely as "labor" and market prices are changed like "wages". As a consequence, through the market mechanism, workers have the opportunity to be converted into tradable commodities. Mosco (2009) explains that commodification occurs through the production process, in which capitalists buy commodities, labor force, and means of production to produce a surplus value that can be used to accumulate even greater capital. Along with the ongoing development of capital, there is a process of exploitation. The commodity labour is reproduced through a process of absolute exploitation through the addition of working hours and relatives when viewed from the intensification of the labour process, which will ultimately increase the acquisition of exchange value for the capitalist.

Karl Marx revealed 5 dimensions that indicate a worker experiences commodification (in Poespowardojo & Seran, 2016). These dimensions can be experienced in stages or can even take place at the same time by the worker. The five dimensions are exploitation, reification, alienation, mystification, and naturalization. Alienation is understood as a form of alienation of workers in their own work after experiencing a number of forms of exploitation. Reification is the process of degenerating the whole human dimension into mere objects. So humans lose their identity as agents for themselves because of diminishing creativity. Furthermore, mystification occurs when commodities are released from the workers who produce them. The process of commodity exchange is usually enriched with certain meanings that are more than just use values. And naturalization is an assumption or an industrial effort to assume that everything that is done is normal and natural. Indeed, such is the relationship between the owners of capital and labor. The result of naturalization is acceptance of this exploitative relationship.

Sennett (2007) argues that currently, various industrial sectors are running the new capitalism, including the media industry. In the new capitalism, there is a cultural form that is considered ideal, namely short-term logic, which suggests that one should think in the short term in order to be successful. Short-term logic demands a fast, instant, and not-too-late process. Such a culture places the media industry in a dilemma. On the one hand, media idealism demands various roles as a means of education. However, economic pragmatism forces the media to adopt a short-term logic that only focuses on spectacular, sensational, superficial, and

various messages (Haryatmoko, 2007). In practice, the media industry cannot be separated from capitalist manoeuvres and short-term logic. Money market capitalism is concerned with short-term performance, capital circulation, and fast economic transactions at the global level.

B. METHODS

This study uses an exploratory study in which researchers seek data by conducting literature studies and analyzing content to be explored further. In this study, researchers analyzed YouTube content from YouTubers Zhiiey Leely and Mboke Memey, as well as several YouTube channels from migrant workers from Indonesia, to further explore how the content was, what became the pattern in their content, etc.

C. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

1. Development of Indonesian Migrant Workers' Personal Accounts on YouTube

Indonesian migrant workers started an explosion of trends as YouTubers roughly starting in 2017, when an Indonesian worker in South Korea named Bajindul managed to get attention and subscribers on his YouTube when he made funny and innocent content about his life as a migrant worker. His real name is Parindra Sidik Cahyono (Tashandra, 2017). With his Javanese accent that is still fluent, Bajindul creates various content such as interacting with native Koreans and this is considered funny by the audience and attracts attention. Armed with his high school diploma from East Java, Bajindul, who works as a labourer in a furniture factory, often uploads videos of his daily life in Korea, such as when he is working in a furniture factory or on a farm. His video when he was walking in Seoul Land has been booming and watched by thousands of people. Bajindul admitted that he had no special knowledge about vloggers. He only knew there was YouTube and tried it.

Bajindul's success in 2017 inspired other migrant workers to start their own YouTube channels. For example, Zhiiey Leely, who is also a migrant worker in South Korea. Zhiiey Leely is a YouTube account owned by a husband-and-wife team of migrant workers who are often called Sister Zhi or Kak Zhi. Both of them migrated to South Korea 5 years ago through the G to G program managed by the Indonesian Agency for Migrant Worker Protection (BP2MI). Zhi's YouTube content started 5 years ago when he initially shared videos about how to prepare to become a migrant worker in South Korea, and then he explained tips on how to become proficient in the Korean language quickly. Zhiiey Leely's YouTube content then grew rapidly, and they regularly post videos about their daily lives in South Korea. Conveniently, Kak Zhi's videos are grouped into 5 categories, namely content at work, *mukbang* content or eating in large portions, challenges from viewers, travel content, and shopping content which is usually done in markets, minimarkets, supermarkets, and roadside vendors.

Another migrant worker who has successfully earned money from YouTube is Nikmatul Rosidah, who now has 1.4 million subscribers. Rosidah, who initially worked in Hong Kong, is now a housewife with 3 children. She is still active on her YouTube channel to share her daily life and recipes for various foods. Isa Yang, a migrant worker in Taiwan as a household assistant, has more than 463.000

subscribers and got a silver play button from YouTube. Isa's content often invites her employers and family to appear on her YouTube. Nindi Yusinta, who is also a migrant worker in South Korea, often displays his daily life and *mukbang* or eating vlogs. Nindi now has 25.000 subscribers.

Sugeng Azka, Alman Mulyana, and Arif Muhammad did not forget to join the ranks of migrant workers who have successfully opened a YouTube channel as their second job. Arif Muhammad started his vlogger career when he worked in Dubai as a hotelkeeper. He started documenting his daily activities as vlog content in Dubai, although he found success when he returned to Indonesia and made a play as Mak Betty on his YouTube account.

The development of YouTube accounts owned by migrant workers is inseparable from how the media has framed them as people who have succeeded and reaped success on YouTube with an amount of income far greater than their income as migrant workers. Zhiiey Leely managed to build a 3-story house and buy a new car, and own a large farm in his hometown. Bajindul, from his channel called Gokil Abis, manages to own a house worth 1 billion and a shop for agricultural materials as well as for renting agricultural equipment and pick-up cars.

This success, which is continuously highlighted by the media, has made the audience, especially other migrant workers, "inspired" to open a similar YouTube channel, so that the trend of YouTubers for migrant workers has occurred. The criticism here is that not everyone can get the same opportunity for success as they do, considering that the era of entering the world of YouTube is different, and how YouTube applies different policies and keeps changing its algorithm. Other migrant workers may unknowingly dive into the YouTube pool, which is already saturated and become a commodity in a cycle called prosumer.

Prosumer is a digital activity by adding new properties that match their performance in the digital world (Planells, 2017). In a participatory concept, prosumers can produce new narratives according to certain canons into the global imagination. Prosumer is actually a symbol of an action, regardless of the object, and the motivation is definitely related to the expectation of getting rewards. In prosumer, the status as a consumer will make them expect to enjoy the results of a project, while the status as a producer aims to make a financial contribution, to be part of the content and structure of a project.

Christian Fuchs explains that in an information society, we are actually in the age of information capitalism (Fuchs & Sandoval, 2014). When information plays an important role in production, the relations in production become on the path of capitalism. Fuchs considers that several forms of capitalism (financial, imperialist, industrial, informational) are interrelated and encourage one another. The concept of a commodity audience currently has some relevance in the era of privatized social media, where consumers not only produce themselves as a commodity to be sold and advertised but also increase self-generated content. Users work without pay and produce content, communication, social relations, and data transactions to become part of the commodity. Users and their data become commodities, characterized by alienation (users do not own the platform, content, or profits), expropriation, and coercion, where they must comply to use commercial platforms to participate in social relations.

2. Transmedia and Widening Space for Commodification

Transmedia cannot be separated from the growth of commodification spaces for migrant workers in the digital realm. The main platform that was initially focused on YouTube is now increasingly diverse and has another strong rival, TikTok.

Reporting from Indonesian data, YouTube users reached 241 million in the second quarter of 2022. Indonesia is the country with the fourth-largest number of smartphone users in the world in 2022. On the other hand, Indonesia is the third-largest YouTube user in the world. This certainly makes us not surprised if the emergence of the YouTuber trend among migrant workers is getting higher. The convenience of YouTube in providing access for anyone creates the perception that every migrant worker who has a YouTube channel will gain the same success without caring about various other factors that will affect the success of his channel, including the YouTube algorithm.

On the Mboke Memey channel, even though it already has 771 subscribers, it turns out that the income you get from YouTube is not much due to YouTube's policies, which we cannot predict. With the YouTube algorithm being erratic and depending on the amount of paid content on various audience profiles, it will indirectly encourage YouTube users to continue working unconsciously due to the encouragement of the algorithm. Mboke Memey is an example of content commodification that keeps happening and enters the prosumer circle without getting commensurate results with high work risks. Apart from having to create content while looking after the employer's children and doing household activities, it also indirectly participates in publicizing the employer's privacy. The process of creating content has no time limit. It can take place during rest hours or at night, which makes YouTubers work "overtime" without being paid, strengthening how the prosumer process occurs due to algorithm demands.

This is now not only happening on YouTube but has also moved to other platforms, such as TikTok. TikTok uses FYP as its main page to display trending content and content according to user preferences through the very sensitive TikTok algorithm. TikTok's success in forming an algorithm that is as sensitive as possible to user tastes has made TikTok the application that now dominates Southeast Asia. Katadata reported that Indonesia's internet usage has fallen but quota costs have risen because TikTok and TikTok's live streaming beat Shopee in Indonesia (Septian, 2023). TikTok is being greatly enjoyed by Indonesians, including Indonesian migrant workers abroad. They often create content that they aim at FYP, not infrequently for the sake of achieving FYP. They sell big salary lures, sad stories of being migrant workers, their struggles, and also sell a sexy body image, which is done a lot. FYP can open the way for them to have large followers and high viewers when live streaming, which can generate additional money. For migrant workers, TikTok is not just a means of entertainment for them but also an additional workplace for them to make a living in overseas lands with extra working hours and without state protection when, for example, harassment occurs in the online realm.

Jenkins describes transmedia in terms of storytelling, in which integral elements of fiction are distributed systemically through various channels with the aim of creating a unified and coordinated entertainment experience (Plessis,

2019). Ideally, each medium makes its own unique contribution to the unfolding of the story. It is a particular story structure that expands through both different languages (verbal, iconic, etc.) and media (cinema, comics, television, video games, etc.). Transmedia storytelling is not just an adaptation of one another. The different media and languages contribute to the construction of the world of transmedia. This textual dispersion is one of the most important sources of complexity in contemporary popular culture. Transmedia storytelling is taking the audience on an emotional journey that goes from moment to moment.

3. Double Commodification in YouTube Content of Indonesian Migrant Workers

The view of the political economy of the media places media content as an important point in the commodification process. Media content becomes a commodity that can be changed from use value to exchange value. The commodification of content is always related to content from a medium that is suitable for sale to the market and adapted to the interests of the market itself. More specifically, the process of commodification of communication involves the process of transforming messages, from bits of data to thought systems, which means into marketable products (Moscow, 2009). The media content provided to the market contains symbols, meanings, information, pictures, everyday stories, and so on that are suitable for market interests. So that the commodification of media content and its format must always be monitored so that it becomes suitable for "trading".

Likewise, with YouTube content, the content creator will try to upload content that the audience likes. To find out what content themes are interesting for the "market" can be seen from the number of viewers for each content. The number of viewers can be monetized by creators. There are quite a few forms of monetizing YouTube accounts, including advertising revenue, channel subscriptions, merchandise galleries, super chat & super stickers, as well as creating content for premium YouTube subscribers. Each form of monetization has its own terms and conditions.

YouTube creators are often tempted by the results of this monetization, even though YouTube imposes quite strict terms and conditions. In order to get target viewers, creators make videos without time and business restrictions, including Indonesian migrant workers who have personal YouTube accounts. Like the account "Mboke Memey" owned by Markhatin Solikha (Atin), which in every video always shows his main daily work as a household assistant in Hong Kong. She records each of her videos while cleaning the house, taking care of the children, cooking, washing, taking the children to school, shopping for her daily menu needs, and so on. The woman from Brebes, Central Java, often seems troubled and uncomfortable when taking videos. In each title of her content, Atin mentions the owner of the house where she works as her employer and often refers to herself as a housemaid.

In several videos, Atin often complains that his main work is actually quite time-consuming. It is evident in several videos, she is often late for food, and is stated in some of the video titles, such as, "NO EMPLOYER KEEPS HAVING !!My Employer Where to Make Indonesian Satay for Their Children!!", "ADD TO THE TROUBLE KELLY RETURNS FROM ENGLAND!!Only Mboke ART dares to manage

the Employer", "MY ACTIVITIES WHEN EMPLOYERS AT HOME || COOK JAPANESE CURRY FOR THE EMPLOYER AND THEIR CHILDREN", "MY STRUGGLE TO TAKE CARE OF MISS REMPONG || RELATED FOR 1 YEAR NOT TO USE A HP TO TAKE CARE OF HIM", "DO THIS IF MISS REMPONG IS SMOKING AGAIN || MAYBE YOU HAVE TO BE EXTRA PATIENT!!!!", etc. Therefore, to document her daily activities, Atin has to spend extra effort.

In several videos, Atin often shares her grievances during her time as a migrant worker, especially about holidays, separation from her family, and obstacles to returning to Indonesia. Some of the video titles he uploaded also feature these complaints, such as "DRAMA MISS REMPONG IF YOU WANT TO GO ON HOLIDAY || HOW IS KIE'S PERSONALITY?", "HONG KONG TKW WORKING HOLIDAYS, PAY IDR 370,000/DAY WHY ARE THEY WORKING???", "Homecoming to Indonesia!!NEKAD HOME ALONE WITHOUT PICKING UP!!GENEVIVE CRYING TO JER", "WANT TO BE MARRIED!!! IT WAS A HOLIDAY DIRECTLY AT THE EMPLOYER'S PICK UP BECAUSE THEIR AN4K WAS CRYING", "SAD!!FREE TO PARENTS WANT TO MIGRATE TO HK AGAIN!!Last DAY IN VILLAGE', "CAN'T TAKE LEAVE HAVE TO GO HOME FOREVER FAILS MY HOPE.....", and others. Atin clearly made extra effort because within a week she uploads at least 2 videos, that is quite productive for a "part-time" YouTuber.

Not only Atin the Mboke Memey who has to make a double effort in each video. Leli Lestari did the same thing through her channel, Zhiee Leely, which started in 2017. In order to get a lot of viewers, she has to document all her daily activities. In fact, her husband contributes daily content to the channel as well. Initially, Leli documented her daily activities in South Korea alone without her husband. However, a year ago, she decided to resign as a migrant worker and return to Indonesia. Since then, the content has been divided into Indonesian content and South Korean content.

Leli's husband, who now still works as a factory worker in South Korea, also makes daily content there. Leli herself also creates special content for her daily life in Indonesia. The reason Leli's husband is involved in creating content in South Korea is that South Korean content has earned many viewers on the Zhiee Leely channel. This is evident from Leli's content when she was still working in the country, which became the most popular video on her channel. The content about South Korea that makes the Zhiee Leely channel earn hundreds of thousands of subscribers. Leli and her husband also have to make extra effort to upload daily vlogs on their YouTube channel. Amid the density of his work as a factory worker in South Korea, he has to find time to make daily vlogs.

While Mboke Memey channel post contents mostly about household chores and parenting, the Zhiee Leely channel documents more about shopping for various foods and necessities at minimarkets/convenience stores in Korea, street food, room tours, and field trips to plantations. Since Leli returned to Indonesia, she has uploaded more diverse content, covering her busy life in Indonesia. At first glance, the contents uploaded by Leli appear to be more diverse than Atin's account. However, as mentioned in Bourdieu's theory of capital, the capital owned by social actors will affect their position in the arena (Harker et al, 2009).

If YouTube becomes an arena for its creators, then the creators with the largest capital will dominate it. In the context of channels belonging to migrant workers in this study, Leli and Atin have different social capital. Leli, who works as

a factory worker in South Korea, has a wider social network than Atin, who works as a household assistant in Hong Kong. Leli has more freedom to determine her activities outside factory working hours, while Atin has fewer "free hours" opportunities because she is tied to her employer and family. Judging from the type of work, Leli works in the formal sector while Atin works in the non-formal sector. That way, the social capital owned by YouTuber creators influences the type and diversity of their content.

Even so, both Atin (Mboke Memey) and Leli and her husband (Zhiee Leely) experienced commodification by YouTube. Without realizing it, they are actually "employed" by YouTube as digital labourers through the content they upload. Christian Fuchs (2014), in his theory of digital labour, explains that social media users are subject to commodification when they are connected to the internet (online). YouTube users, including creators, actually cannot be said to get a salary. In fact, they produce values which are then commodified by capital, in this study, YouTube. According to Fuchs (2014), social media users who are constantly connected to the internet will not be able to convert their "work" to make ends meet. Thus, YouTube implements what Karl Marx calls the "added value" of labourers' work.

The object of YouTube's labour is the human experience. Before social media, the human experience was more private, isolated, and disconnected from one another. YouTube makes it public and connected. All experiences uploaded by Atin and Leli to their personal channels are made into YouTube as a commodity for economic interests. Through the logic of digital capitalism, we can find that digital labour products are data that represent individual and social experiences, which are open to the public. Apart from that, it can be said that life has become a factory, and workers' workspace is widespread, almost in all daily activities of the creators. This then becomes an important element in the accumulation of capital for social media.

If well-known YouTubers are generally born into privileged circles, Atin and Leli actually come from economically vulnerable groups. Since the beginning, their position as migrant workers has been used as a commodity, not only by their distribution agencies, but also by the state. They voluntarily decided to share their life experiences on YouTube, which becomes double commodification by the channelling agent - the state and YouTube. Both should spend more time shooting videos, editing, and uploading them. They absolutely work overtime because they have to complete their main jobs and then become digital labourers. This multiplied work certainly brings multiple risks, such as health and personal risks.

Furthermore, the content creators among migrant workers have lost most of their personal interests in their daily lives. As seen in the videos of the Mboke Memey account, 80% of the content is always shared with Memey (the employer's child who is raised by Atin). Because her main job is a domestic worker, most of Atin's video backgrounds are her employer's house. Fortunately, the employer where Atin works allows her to record activities at the house along with the family. However, the issue of personal interest can also be a boomerang for migrant workers when creating content, especially those who work as household assistants. If they record and upload content of the employer's house and family without permission, there is a risk of being brought to justice. Likewise, Leli and her husband recorded their work at the factory several times, and both of them

risk being brought into legal action if they record things that are prohibited. Both are clearly missing some of the private objects, such as home position, family members, and their daily network.

4. Exploitation and Alienation of Indonesian Migrant Workers as YouTube Creators

In the realm of digital capitalism, there is immaterial work in social media. Immaterial work is defined as work that produces non-material products, such as communication, information, knowledge, and social relations (Hardt & Negri, 2004). The concept of immaterial work raises various opinions about exploitation and alienation. Fuchs & Sevignani (2018) argue that activity on social media, including YouTube, has alienated humans. They see activities in cyberspace as productive work (work that can be made into a commodity), which can alienate humans in three dimensions, including alienation from oneself, alienation from productive work objects in the form of work instruments (technology), and alienation from the products they create. The three-kind of alienation takes place in the entire production process, which is caused by the existence of power relations and results in exploitation.

However, it is very difficult for YouTube creators, including those migrant workers, to see this exploitation. The main reason that is most visible is that social media has a new kind of participatory and democratic culture, thus making its users want to be productive. Second, the exploitation side seems absent because social media is used in one's spare time. On the Mboke Memey and Zhiee Leely channels, we can see that both of them upload videos during their free time. Even though from Atin's point of view (owner of the Mboke Memey channel), her free time is more difficult, she tries to make videos when her main work is not too busy. Meanwhile, Leli and her husband record most of their videos on the Zhiee Leely channel during their free time, such as eating, walking, and shopping. Both YouTube creators and viewers will feel that they are using YouTube as entertainment and looking for fun. That is why Fuchs coined the term "playbour," which gives added value like playing.

At first glance, being a YouTuber is a relaxed and seemingly free job because creators can create content at any time, without time limits. In the results of Himatul Ulya's research (2019), YouTubers feel the opposite. Indeed, on the one hand, you can be free because there are no working hours, but the lack of working hours is what traps you, because YouTube has terms and conditions through the YouTube Partnership Program (YPP) policy. Because of the strict terms and conditions that make working terms without time limits tricky and tricky. Creators, including Atin and Leli, are "forced" to meet these stringent requirements so that their channels can continue to be productive and monetized. Until now, there has been no official regulation from the government to regulate digital industry matters and protect the rights of digital workers.

Furthermore, with regard to the concept of alienation, all content uploaded by creators, especially from migrant workers, becomes very important data for the YouTube corporation. These data cannot be owned by video creators

due to limited ownership of technological means. YouTube, as a digital corporation, certainly has more sophisticated and complete technological facilities than its users, making the social media corporation entitled to claim ownership of user data. Meanwhile, creators cannot enjoy data on their work "without a time limit". Even though these data have the potential to be "sold" to advertisers. That is what causes YouTube creators to be alienated from their work.

As YouTube creators, Atin and Leli also experience alienation from their work. All they can know is what content topics interest their audience. They cannot "sell" these contents directly to advertisers. It is YouTube that determines the advertisements through YouTube AdSense. The alienation experienced by Atin and Leli doubled because they also work as migrant workers in their respective countries. Like Atin (Mboke Memey), most of the videos are only at home while raising children. She only leaves the house to pick up and drop off from school, go shopping, and if his employer takes Atin out for certain events. Even on holidays, Atin rarely leaves the house, except when meeting some friends.

However, Atin's daily vlog feels freer and more diverse when she returns to Indonesia. Meanwhile, Leli and her husband (Zhiee Leely) seem to be experiencing less isolation as seen from several traveling videos. When Leli started making daily vlogs, she showed her life as a factory worker who also experienced alienation because she not only works in the factory area. Leli also lived in dormitories around the factory. She can be released from alienation when she decides to resign and return to her country.

D. CONCLUSION

Indonesian migrant workers who open YouTube channels and become vloggers have indirectly been commodified and entered into the prosumer process circle. The commodification in question is where migrant workers work continuously for YouTube by producing content to suit YouTube and other social media algorithms to encourage the improvement of their economy, because being a migrant worker is seem less welfare for them. Being YouTubers means that YouTube commodifies them, making migrant workers have to do a double job with double risk in the digital space, where so far, there are no regulations by the government. Differences in work background among migrant workers, such as a domestic assistant and a factory worker, made a different commodification impact on them.

This research can be developed, such as conducting quantitative research on how many Indonesian migrant workers open YouTube channels, what is the impact on their welfare, and to what extent their income has increased after opening new jobs in the digital space.

2. REFERENCES

- Abercrombie, Nicholas, Stephen Hill, and Bryan S. Turner. 2006. *Dictionary Of Sociology*. London: Penguin Books.
- Arief, Andie M. 2023. "Anwar Ibrahim Promises to Fix Problems with Indonesian Migrant Workers This Year - Katadata.co.id National." Katadata.

<https://katadata.co.id/ameidyonasution/berita/63bbf493a0c0c/anwar-ibrahim-pledge-benahi-hasil-pekerja-migran-ri-tahun-ini>.

Corvalan, C., T. Driscoll, and J. Harrison. 1994. "Role of migrants factors in work-related facilities in Australia." *Scand J Work Environ Health*, 364-370.

Deng, Jian B., Hermin I. Wahyuni, and Vissia I. Yulianto. 2020. "Labor migration from Southeast Asia to Taiwan: issues, public responses and future development." *Asian Education and Development Studies* 10, no. 1 (May): 69-81. <https://doi.org/10.1108/AEDS-02-2019-0043>.

Don, Z. M., and C. Lee. 2014. "Representing immigrants as illegals, threats, and victims in Malaysia: Elite voices in the media." *Discourse and Society*, 687-705.

Fashri, Fauzi. 2014. *Pierre Bourdieu: Uncovering the Power of Symbols*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.

Fitzgerald, S., X. Chen, H. Qu, and M. Sheff. 2013. "Occupational injury among migrant workers in China: a systematic review." *Inj Prev*, 348-354.

Fuchs, Christian, and Marisol Sandoval, eds. 2014. *Critique, Social Media and the Information Society*. N.p.: Routledge.

Fuchs, Christian & Seignani, Sebastian. 2018. *Recognizing the Differences between Digital Labor and General Digital Work*: Indoprogess.

Fuchs, Christian. 2014. *Digital Labour and Karl Marx*. London: Routledge.

Fuchs, Christian. 2014b. "Digital Prosumption Labour on Social Media in the Context of the Capitalist Regime of Time". *Time & Society*, 2014, Vol. 23(1) 97.

Gane, Nicholas and Beer, David. 2008. *New Media: The Key Concepts*. Oxford: Berg Publisher.

Giddens, Anthony (trans.). 2010. *Structural Theory: Fundamentals of the Formation of Community Social Structure*. Yogyakarta: Student Libraries

Hardt, Michael and Negri, Antonio. 2004. *Multitude*. New York: Penguin.

Harker, Richard, dkk. (ed.). *(Habitus X Capital) + Domain = Practice: The Most Comprehensive Introduction to Pierre Bourdieu's Thought*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.

Hugo, G. A. 2014. "A multisited approach to analysis of destination immigration data: an Asia Example." *Int Migration Rev*, 998-1027.

A LITTLE. 2010. *Labour Migration from Indonesia: An Overview of Indonesian Migration to Selected Destination in Asia and the Middle East*. Jakarta: IOM.

Jenkins, Henry. 2004. *Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media*. New York: New York University Press.

Jenkins, H., & Deuze, M. (2008). Editorial: Convergence Culture. *Convergence*, 14(1), 5–12. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1354856507084415>

KhosraviNik, M. 2009. "The representation of refugees, asylum seekers and immigrants in British newspaper during the Balkan conflict (1999) and the British general election (2005)." *Discourse and Society*, 477-498.

Koslowski, R., ed. 2011. *Global Mobility Regimes*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan US.

Lubis, Akhyar Yusuf. 2014. *Postmodernism: Theory and Methods*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.

Marin, M. L. n.d. "When crossing borders: recognizing the sexual and reproductive health and rights of women migrant workers." *Arrow for Change* 2013:2-5.

Martyn, H. L. 2017. "Voices of Indonesian Migrant Workers at Home and Abroad." *Asian Social Science* 14 (8). 10.5539/ass.v14n8p119.

- McChesney, R. W., Wood, E. M., & Foster, J. B. (Eds.). 1998. *Capitalism and the Information Age: The Political Economy of the Global Communication Revolution*. Monthly Review Press.
- "Migration facts and figures." n.d. International Organization for Migration. Accessed January 25, 2023. <http://www.iom.org/bd/page/facts-and-figures>.
- "Migration in Asia and the Pacific | IOM, UN Migration." n.d. International Organization for Migration. Accessed January 25, 2023. <http://www.iom.int/asia-and-pacific>.
- Mosk, Vincent. 2009. *The Political Economy of Communication*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Mou, J., S. Fong, and M. Dawes. 2014. "Defining migration and its health impact in China." *Public Health*.
- Planells, Antonio J. 2017. "Video games and the crowdfunding ideology: From the gamer-buyer to the prosumer-investor." *Journal of Consumer Culture* 17 (3): 620-638. 10.1177/1469540515611200.
- Plessis, Charmaine d. 2019. "Prosumer engagement through story-making in transmedia branding." *International Journal of Cultural Studies* 22 (1): 175-192. 10.1177/1367877917750445.
- Poespowardojo, Soejanto & Seran, Alexander. 2016. *Discourse on Critical Theories*. Jakarta: Kompas Media Nusantara
- Ritzer, George and Douglas J. Goodman. 2012. *Modern Sociological Theory*. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Group.
- Rizer, George. 2011. *Sociological Theory*. New York: McGraw Hill.
- Septiani, Lenny. 2023. "Internet Usage in RI Decreases but Quota Costs Increase due to TikTok - Katadata.co.id Technology." *Katadata*, February 1, 2023. <https://katadata.co.id/desysetyowati/digital/63d9f71c3bb98/pemakaian-internet-di-ri-turun-tapi-biaya-kuota-naik-karena-tiktok>.
- Sennett, Richard. 2007. *The Culture of The New Capitalism*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Shields, Johns & Grant, D. 2010. *Psychologizing the Subject: HRM, Commodification, and the Objectification of Labour*. *The Economic and Labour Relations Review*, 20(2), 61-76. doi:10.1177/103530461002000205
- Takwin, Great. 2003. *Ideological Roots: Introduction to the Study of Ideological Concepts from Plato to Bourdieu*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Tashandra, Nabilla. 2017. "The Story of Bajindul, Indonesian Migrant Workers in South Korea who Become a "Ndeso Vlogger."" *Kompas.com*, September 12, 2017. <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/09/12/14373371/kisah-bajindul-tki-di-korsel-yang-sukses-jadi-vlogger-ndeso>.
- Toffler, Alvin. 1980. *The Third Wave*. New York: William Morrow.
- Ulya. Himmatul. 2019. *Commodification of Workers for Beginner and Underrated Youtubers (Case Study of Youtube Indonesia)*. *Interaction: Journal of Communication Science*, Vol.8(2), pp.1-12.